

## **Minutes of 17<sup>th</sup> Meeting of ECF Waste Recovery Projects Vetting Sub-Committee**

**Date** : 21 September 2007 (Friday)

**Time** : 10:00a.m. – 12:00 noon

**Venue** : Conference Room 2825, 28/F, Southorn Centre, Wan Chai, Hong Kong

### **Present**

The Honourable CHOY So Yuk, JP (Chairperson)

Mr. Ricky FAN

Mr. HO Siu Ping

Dr. Arthur LAU

Mr. LEUNG Wai On

Mr. LUI Tung Ming

Professor POON Chi Sun

Professor Jonathan WONG

Dr. YAU Wing KWONG

Ms. Sandy CHEUNG

Environmental Protection Department (EPD)

Miss Sonia LO

EPD (Secretary)

Miss Doris NG

EPD (Assistant Secretary)

### **Absent with apologies**

Mr. CHUNG Kong Mo

Mr. Barry KWONG

Mr. LAM Kwok Hing, JP

Ms. Goretti LAU

Ms. LEUNG Oi Mui, Amy

Ms. Edith NGAN

Dr. TSANG Po Keung, Eric

### **In attendance**

Dr. Ellen CHAN EPD

Mr. Alphonso HUNG EPD

Mr. C.S.LAI EPD

Mr. David LAI EPD

### **Welcoming Remark**

The Chairperson welcomed all Members, Dr. Ellen CHAN and representatives of the EPD.

#### **I. Confirmation of minutes of last meeting**

2. The minutes of the 16th meeting held on 21 June 2007 were confirmed without amendment.

## **II. Vetting of Applications**

### **(a) Budget Revision of Approved Project (No. 121: Programme of Greening Community by Recycling organized by DAB Kowloon City Branch)**

3. Miss Sonia LO briefed Members that agreement had been given to the applicant at the last meeting on 21 June 2007 to increase the budget for “Souvenirs” up to \$110,000 (i.e. the ceiling of this expenditure item capped at 30% of the total approved budget of the project in accordance with the Guide to Application) by redeployment of resources within the approved budget of the project. That said, the applicant was requested to provide justification and revised budget of the project for Members’ consideration. The Meeting noted the revised budget submitted and approved the applicant’s request for increasing the budget for “Souvenirs” to \$110,528 and the budget for “Insurance” from \$4,000 to \$5,500. The additional budget would be fully absorbed by the savings from the expenditure items “Project co-ordinator” and “Part-time staff”.

(Note: The Chairperson declared interest and abstained from the discussion of the application and Professor POON Chi Sun chaired the meeting for this agenda item.)

### **(b) 2 new applications on Community Waste Recovery Projects**

4. Miss Sonia LO briefed Members on the 2 new CWR applications (no. 135 and 136). After discussion, the Meeting rejected the 2 new applications. Details of the decision were given at **Appendix I**.

## **III. Programme on Source Separation of Domestic Waste (SSW Programme)**

### **(a) Progress Report of SSW Programme**

5. Mr. C.S. LAI reported the latest progress of the SSW Programme. In brief, the SSW Programme was running effectively in improving the overall domestic waste recovery rate. As at September 2007, 696 public and private housing estates/buildings signed up to join the Programme. A total of 103 applications for partial ECF funding support were received, including 46 approved applications (at a total approved amount of about \$1.6 million), 17 withdrawn/rejected applications and 40 applications in process. Among the 46 approved applications, 26 applicants had completed the installation of waste separation facilities in their estates/buildings. The site inspections conducted by EPD revealed that these approved applicants had installed the waste separation facilities properly.

6. Mr. C.S. LAI tabled the 2006 Annual Report on SSW Programme and shared with Members some positive comments from the residential organisations, property management companies and residents of the SSW model estates. The Meeting discussed and suggested that publicity efforts be stepped up to enlist more housing estates/ buildings to join the SSW Programme. In this relation, the Chairperson

proposed and the Meeting agreed to organize a visit to some successful SSW participating estates for Members and the press. The Chairperson further suggested that EPD should explore the feasibility of extending the implementation of SSW programme to schools and commercial buildings. Dr. Arthur LAU also suggested extending the SSW programme to villa-type residential developments and villages.

7. The Chairperson enquired and Mr. C.S. LAI replied that the production of the first batch of metal bins was expected to be completed by December 2007. Mr. C.S. LAI explained that these metal bins would be provided to single-block buildings free of charge as SSW facilities under a trial run and that at most two bins would be provided to each single-block building.

(Note: Mr. LEUNG Wai On declared interest that his company was the contractor of the new recycling bins. He clarified that the delay in the bin production was mainly due to the changes of bin design to fulfill the fire safety requirements.)

8. Dr. Ellen CHAN reported that the Government had provided one or more sets of 3-coloured recycling bins to about 1400 housing estates/buildings free of charge for recycling waste paper, plastic bottles and aluminum cans from 1998 onwards through the Environmental Campaign Committee. She added that EPD was reviewing the design of these bins and considering their replacement because -

- i) the 3-coloured recycling bins had been used for many years and most of them were worn out; and
- ii) consequential to the launch of the territory-wide SSW Programme in 2005, the estates were encouraged to expand the types of recyclables collected by the recycling bins to cover all types of paper, metals and plastics etc. The small openings of these 3-coloured recycling bins could no longer meet this new mode of recycling.

9. Members supported in general the review and replacement of the 3-coloured recycling bins. The Meeting was of the view that the Government should not involve in the collection of recyclable materials in estates and that the proceeds generated from sales of recyclables should be returned to the estates as an incentive to boost the recovery rate. In response to Members' inquiry, Dr. Ellen CHAN replied that the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD) only provided recyclables collection service to venues managed by the Government such as public place, park, leisure and cultural facilities, as well as some schools and that all estates were now making their own collection arrangement of the recyclables. Members also enquired about the cost of recyclables collection service made by FEHD.

(Post-meeting Note: FEHD provided information to the Secretariat on 25 September 2007 that they provided collection service of the three types of recyclable wastes, namely waste paper, metal containers and plastic materials from the 3-coloured recycling bins placed at some 2000 locations in public places, schools, clinics and departmental venues. The collection service for the period from May 2007 to April

2008 has been contracted out to two contractors at a total cost of \$2.62 million.)

**(b) 29 new applications on Source Separation of Domestic Waste Projects**

10. Mr. David LAI briefed Members on the new applications. After discussion, Members approved the 29 new applications with a total allocation of \$1,304,138.25. Details of the 29 applications were given at **Appendix II**.

**V. Any Other Business**

**(a) Irregularities found in completed waste recovery projects no. 6 and no. 65 organized by the Hong Kong People's Council on Housing Policy**

11. Ms. Sandy CHEUNG briefed Members on the 2 completed projects no. 6 and 65 organized by Hong Kong People's Council on Housing Policy Hung Hom Community Services Centre and Hung Hom Residents' Association (*HHRA being the joint organizer of project no. 6 only*) and the irregularities found in the statement of accounts as outlined in the 2 papers tabled for Members' reference. The Meeting considered that such unsatisfactory performance should be duly taken into account when vetting its future application for funding support from the Environment and Conservation Fund (ECF). After discussion, Members agreed to take the following actions -

Project No.	Decision of Meeting and Actions to be taken
6 - Hung Hom Green Economic Community Pilot Project	<u>(Note)</u>
65 - Hung Hom Green Economic Project	<u>(Note)</u>

12. There being no other business, the Meeting was adjourned at 12:00 noon.

**Waste Recovery Projects Vetting Sub-Committee Secretariat  
October 2007**

(Note: The ECFC webpage contains a general disclaimer that reasons for supporting / rejecting an applicant had been made known to the project proponents concerned, and the public could ask the project proponents direct for such information. The detailed reasons for supporting or rejecting an application is not included in this version of minute of meeting to be uploaded to the webpage of ECFC according to this standard practice.)

**New Application Vetted at 17th Meeting  
of Waste Recovery Projects Vetting Sub-Committee on 21 September 2007**

No.	Organization	Project	Applied Amount (\$)	Approved Amount (\$)	Decision	Remarks
135	Hong Kong Environmental Protection Foundation Ltd.	Separate Waste, Save Our Resources	\$522,736	-	Rejected	<u>(Note)</u>
136	St. Paul's Ministry Christianity Organization	Puzzle 'The Blue Sky City' III – Camera Recycle Community Recycle	\$499,992.4	-	Rejected	<u>(Note)</u>

Note: The ECFC webpage contains a general disclaimer that reasons for supporting / rejecting an applicant had been made known to the project proponents concerned, and the public could ask the project proponents direct for such information. The detailed reasons for supporting or rejecting an application is not included in this version of minute of meeting to be uploaded to the webpage of ECFC according to this standard practice.

**29 Applications under Source Separation of Domestic Waste Programme**

No.	Estate	Name of Resident Organization	Name of Applicant	Requested Funding (\$)	Approved Amount (\$)	Equipment / facilities to be installed. Remarks by EPD
SSW050	Kenswood Court, Kingswood Villas	Kenswood Court Estate Owners' Committee	Citybase Property Management Limited	172,360	172,360	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A fibreglass recycle bin in the staircase landing area on each floor</li> </ul>
SSW051	Mei Foo Sun Chuen-Stage IV	The Incorporated Owners of Mei Foo Sun Chuen-Stage IV	Same	26,507.25	26,507.25	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Installation of a plastic board and metal racks</li> <li>• Plastic recycle bins in the refuse room on each floor</li> </ul>
SSW052	Tsz Oi Court Stage III	The Incorporated Owners of Tsz Oi Court Stage III	Guardian Property Management Limited	192,000	192,000	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A stainless steel recycle bin in the refuse room on each floor</li> </ul> <p><u>The Meeting</u> also noted the applicant's declaration of conflict of interest between the supplier of the recycling bins and the management company, and the quotation obtained by EPD. Considering the tendering exercise and selection of supplier being complied with the procurement procedures as required by the WRPVSC and the guides of ICAC, <u>the Meeting</u> approved the selection of Guardian Care Limited (the supplier of lowest quotation) as proposed by the applicant.</p>

No.	Estate	Name of Resident Organization	Name of Applicant	Requested Funding (\$)	Approved Amount (\$)	Equipment / facilities to be installed. Remarks by EPD
SSW053	Waldorf Garden	Owners Committee of Waldorf Garden	Same	103,200	103,200	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A fiberglass recycle bin in the staircase landing area on each floor</li> </ul>
SSW054	Yue King Building	The Incorporated Owners of Yue King Building	Same	20,460	20,460	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A fibreglass recycle bin in the staircase landing area on each floor</li> </ul>
SSW055	Shaukeiwan Plaza	The Incorporated Owners of Shaukeiwan Plaza	Same	39,060	38,745	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A stainless steel recycle bin in the staircase landing area on each floor</li> </ul>
SSW056	Vista Paradiso	The Incorporated Owners of Vista Paradiso	Goodwell Property Management Limited	85,500	85,500	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• An aluminium recycle rack in the refuse room on each floor</li> </ul>
SSW057	Laguna Verde	Estate Owners' Committee of Laguna Verde	Goodwell Property Management Limited	174,625	94,297.5	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Plastic recycle bins in the refuse room on each floor</li> </ul> <p>EPD considered the 3 quotations submitted by the applicant as excessively high. As revealed by the quotation of the proposed recycling bins obtained by EPD, the cost of the recycling bins was about \$300, which was much lower than the lowest quotation submitted by the applicant. <u>The Meeting</u> decided that the approved grant for the recycling bins should be made based on the lowest quotation obtained by EPD. The approval letter together with the decision of the Meeting on this application would be copied to the owners' committee of the estates for information.</p>

No.	Estate	Name of Resident Organization	Name of Applicant	Requested Funding (\$)	Approved Amount (\$)	Equipment / facilities to be installed. Remarks by EPD
SSW058	New Man Lee Building	The Incorporated Owners of New Man Lee Building	Guardian Property Management Limited	17,600	17,600	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A stainless steel recycle bin in the staircase landing area on each floor</li> </ul>
SSW059	Tuen Mun Tai Hing Gardens Phase II	The Incorporated Owners of Tuen Mun Tai Hing Gardens Phase II	Same	63,415	63,415	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Installation of an aluminium rack</li> <li>• Plastic recycle baskets in the refuse room on each floor</li> </ul>
SSW060	Wing Fok Centre	The Incorporated Owners of Wing Fok Centre	Guardian Property Management Limited	134,400	134,400	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A stainless steel recycle bin in the refuse room on each floor</li> </ul>
SSW061	Sunglow Building	The Incorporated Owners of Sunglow Building	Same	4,776	4,776	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Plastic recycle bins in the refuse room on each floor</li> <li>• Replacement of refuse room door locks with keys</li> </ul>
SSW062	Fu Yau Building	The Incorporated Owners of Fu Yau Building	Same	9,000	9,000	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A stainless steel recycle bin in the material recovery room on each floor</li> </ul>
SSW063	Madam S. H. Ho Residence for Medical Students, The University of Hong Kong	Madam S. H. Ho Residence for Medical Students, The University of Hong Kong	Same	5,180	5,180	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A stainless steel recycle bin in the pantry on each floor</li> </ul> <p><u>The Meeting</u> agreed that the student halls of the University of Hong Kong were a special type of residential buildings and should also be supported under the ECF's SSW Programme funding scheme. The applications (SSW no. 63 – 73) for funding support for the 11 student halls of the University of Hong Kong were approved.</p>

No.	Estate	Name of Resident Organization	Name of Applicant	Requested Funding (\$)	Approved Amount (\$)	Equipment / facilities to be installed. Remarks by EPD
SSW064	R C Lee Hall, The University of Hong Kong	R C Lee Hall, The University of Hong Kong	Same	10,360	10,360	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A stainless steel recycle bin in the pantry on each floor</li> </ul>
SSW065	Lee Hysan Hall, The University of Hong Kong	Lee Hysan Hall, The University of Hong Kong	Same	11,200	11,200	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A stainless steel recycle bin in the pantry on each floor</li> </ul>
SSW066	Wei Lun Hall, The University of Hong Kong	Wei Lun Hall, The University of Hong Kong	Same	11,200	11,200	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A stainless steel recycle bin in the pantry on each floor</li> </ul>
SSW067	University Hall, The University of Hong Kong	University Hall, The University of Hong Kong	Same	2,400	2,400	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A stainless steel recycle bin in the activity room on each floor</li> </ul>
SSW068	Lady Ho Tung Hall, The University of Hong Kong	Lady Ho Tung Hall, The University of Hong Kong	Same	15,280	15,280	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A stainless steel recycle bin in the common room on each floor</li> <li>Fibreglass recycle bins on the ground floor</li> </ul>
SSW069	Starr Hall, The University of Hong Kong	Starr Hall, The University of Hong Kong	Same	18,905	18,905	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A stainless steel recycle bin in the common room on each floor</li> <li>Fibreglass recycle bins on the ground floor</li> </ul>
SSW070	Swire Hall, The University of Hong Kong	Swire Hall, The University of Hong Kong	Same	9,250	8,000	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A stainless steel recycle bin in the washroom on each floor</li> </ul>
SSW071	Lee Shau Kee Hall, The University of Hong Kong	Lee Shau Kee Hall, The University of Hong Kong	Same	12,000	12,000	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A stainless steel recycle bin in the pantry on each floor</li> </ul>

No.	Estate	Name of Resident Organization	Name of Applicant	Requested Funding (\$)	Approved Amount (\$)	Equipment / facilities to be installed. Remarks by EPD
SSW072	Morrison Hall, The University of Hong Kong	Morrison Hall, The University of Hong Kong	Same	12,000	12,000	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A stainless steel recycle bin in the pantry on each floor</li> </ul>
SSW073	Suen Chi Sun Hall, The University of Hong Kong	Suen Chi Sun Hall, The University of Hong Kong	Same	12,000	12,000	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A stainless steel recycle bin in the pantry on each floor</li> </ul>
SSW074	The Grandiose	Environmental Protection Team, The Grandiose	MTR Corporation Limited	87,000	86,700	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A plastic recycle bin in the refuse room on each floor of Block 1 &amp; 3;</li> <li>• A plastic recycle bin covered with metal plates in the service lift lobby on each floor of Block 2</li> </ul>
SSW075	Harcourt Garden	The Incorporated Owners of Harcourt Garden	Guardian Property Management Limited	9,600	9,600	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A stainless steel recycle bin in the staircase landing area on each floor</li> </ul>
SSW076	Lung Cheung Court (龍翔苑)	The Incorporated Owners of Lung Cheung Court	Guardian Property Management Limited	63,200	63,200	<u>Approved items</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A stainless steel recycle bin in the staircase landing area on each floor</li> </ul> <p><u>The Meeting</u> noted that there was a redevelopment plan of the estate (with no definite schedule) and that at present, owners' consensus was being obtained. Considering the long processing time for finalization and implementation of the redevelopment, <u>the Meeting</u> approved the funding for this application.</p>

No.	Estate	Name of Resident Organization	Name of Applicant	Requested Funding (\$)	Approved Amount (\$)	Equipment / facilities to be installed. Remarks by EPD
SSW077	La Costa, Discovery Bay (愉景灣海堤居)	La Costa Village Owner's Committee	Same	34,400	34,400	<p><u>Approved items</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A stainless steel recycle bin in the refuse room on each floor of the high-rise blocks and on G/F of the low-rise blocks</li> </ul> <p>The applicant proposed to install the stainless steel recycling bins on G/F for the low-rise blocks, which would be placed next to the refuse bins for centrally collection of refuse and recyclables. Though the recycling facilities were not placed on each floor, EPD considered such arrangement was in line with floor to floor waste separation mode. The application was approved.</p>
SSW078	Parkridge Village, Discovery Bay (愉景灣明翠台)	Parkridge Village Owners' Committee	Same	29,452.5	29,452.5	<p><u>Approved items</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Plastic recycle stacks in the refuse room on each floor of the high-rise blocks</li> <li>Plastic recycle bins in rows in the refuse room on each floor of low-rise blocks</li> </ul>
<b>Total approved amount:</b>					<b>\$1,304,138.25</b>	