

**Minutes of the 3rd Meeting of the
Energy Conservation Projects Vetting Subcommittee
held on 18 November 2013 at 2:30 p.m.**

Present

Mr. Edward Leung	(Chairman)
Ms Agnes Chan	
Dr. Chan Fuk-cheung	
Dr. Cynthia Lam	
Mr. Kendrew Leung	
Mr. Man Mo-leung	
Dr. Daniel Tsang	
Ms Betty Cheung	EPD
Mrs. Dorothy Ma	ENB

In Attendance

Miss Francesca Sin	EPD	(Secretary)	
Ms Anita SW Tsui	EPD		
Mr. Steve Tsoi	EPD		
Mr. Simon Kam	EPD		
Mr. Jordan Leung	EPD		
Mr. Andy Ho	ENB		
Mr. Szeto Wing-sum	EMSTF	}	for item 6 only
Mr. Raymond Tong	EMSTF		

Absent with Apologies

Mr. Alfred Lee
Mr. Wong Kin-wai
Mr. Douglas Woo
Mr. Yang Wing-kit

Welcoming Remarks

The Chairman welcomed members to the third meeting of the Environment and Conservation Fund (ECF) Energy Conservation Projects Vetting Subcommittee (ECPVSC).

Agenda Item 1: Confirmation of the Minutes of the Previous Meeting

2. The draft minutes of the previous meeting held on 23 September 2013 were endorsed by Members without amendment.

Agenda Item 2: Matters Arising from the Minutes of the Previous Meeting

3. Mr. Steve Tsoi recapitulated that at the previous meeting, Members concluded that the Secretariat should send a written request to the Mission Health Greens (MHG) for an explanation on the various issues and concerns raised in relation to the projects DCP0013 (Year 2 Project) and ECP0356, to enable Members to further review the matter. In response to Members' enquiries about the progress, Mr. Tsoi informed Members that the Secretariat had written to MHG on 16 October 2013, and requested MHG to provide its responses in two weeks. The Secretariat received MHG's substantive reply dated 8 November 2013 on 11 November 2013. At MHG's request, the reply had been circulated to Members for information.

4. Note

5. Note

6. Note

7. Note

8. Note

9. Note

10. Note

Agenda Item 3: New Applications for Energy-cum-carbon Audits and Energy Improvement Works of ECPNGO Scheme (ECPVSC Paper 6/2013-14)

11. The Chairman declared, and the meeting noted, that he was the Executive Director of Hong Kong Playground Association, the applicant organization of project ECP0317.

12. Ms Francesca Sin briefed the meeting about Paper 6/2013-14 which set out a summary of 115 funding applications for energy-cum-carbon audits (ECA) and energy improvement works (EIW) projects. She also drew Members' attention to the withdrawal of 6 projects previously approved by ECPVSC and 7 other ECA/EIW applications. Ms Sin recapitulated that after taking into consideration the funding requirements of the various funding schemes, the ECFC agreed that funding support for the outstanding applications of the ECPNGO scheme should be spread over a period of three years (i.e. from 2013-14 to 2015-16), and that a budget of \$30 million should be allocated for supporting ECPNGO applications in 2013-14.

13. Note

14. After deliberation, Members approved 113 applications and rejected 2 applications as proposed in the ECPVSC Paper 6/2013-14.

Agenda Item 4: Request for Reimbursement of Expenditure on Removed Lighting Installations under ECPNGO Scheme (ECPVSC Paper 7/2013-14)

15. Ms Francesca Sin informed the meeting that the Tung Wah Group of Hospitals (TWGH) had requested for reimbursement of \$45,489.48 for 187 sets of lighting tubes which it claimed to have been installed at three TWGH service centres under an EIW project (i.e. ECP0111), but which were subsequently found by the Secretariat as removed from the sites upon a verification inspection conducted after project completion. Ms Sin added that in response to the Secretariat's request for clarifications on the discrepancies, TWGH explained that after the completion of works and certification of completion report by the Qualified Service Provider, staff of the service centres removed the lighting tubes in question, as they considered that the lighting in some areas was too bright. The removed installations were put away for future use. TWGH considered that the expenditure for these removed lighting items should be reimbursed by the ECF as they had actually been installed at one time.

16. Ms Francesca Sin said that the Secretariat was of the view that it was not suitable for the ECF to reimburse the expenditure for the removed lighting items. She said that the ECPVSC had granted a budget of \$49,500 for TWGH to engage a QSP whose role was to, inter alia, certify the detailed scope of the project, including justifying the cost effectiveness of the proposed installations, monitoring the procurement of goods and services, supervising the project and certifying compliance with the relevant Building Energy Codes. If TWGH and its QSP had better coordinated to ensure the effective use of ECF grants to meet the service units' specific requirements, the procurement, installation and subsequent removal of such a substantial number of lighting tubes (187 numbers) should have been avoided. Hence, it might not be appropriate for the ECF to cover the expenditure of such "surplus" lighting tubes removed under the circumstances.

17. Note

18. Note

19. Note

20. After discussion, Members agreed that the amount of \$45,489.48 for the 187 lighting items in question should be reimbursed to TWGH, but that the Secretariat should write to remind TWGH to prevent the recurrence of similar incidents in future, in order to avoid unnecessary wastage of resources.

Agenda Item 5: ECPNGO Scheme Progress Report (ECPVSC Paper 8/2013-14)

21. Ms Francesca Sin briefed members on the progress of the ECPNGO scheme as at 31 October 2013. In sum, a total of 795 applications were received including 44 education programmes, 50 energy-cum-carbon audits and 701 energy improvement projects. Total funding approved amounted to \$121.95 million for a total of 440 projects, including 31 education programmes, 44 energy-cum-carbon audits and 365 energy improvement works. It was estimated that when all of the approved projects were completed, the savings in electricity and reduction in carbon dioxide emissions per annum would be 12.01 million kWh and 8,407 tonnes respectively.

22. Members noted the progress of the ECPNGO scheme.

**Agenda Item 6: Variation to an Approved Project under BEEFS
(ECPVSC Paper 9/2013-14)**

23. Mr. Szeto Wing-sum briefed Members about the request for increasing the approved funding by \$1,000 from \$249,060 to \$250,060 for BEEFS project EEP0578. The recipient organization originally estimated that income could be generated from the sale of the replaced installation, and thus \$1,000 could be deducted from the project expenditure subsidized under BEEFS. The replaced installation, however, generated no revenue. The recipient organization thus requested to increase the funding to cover the difference.

24. Note

25. After deliberation, Members approved to increase the approved funding by \$1,000 from \$249,060 to \$250,060 for BEEFS project EEP0578.

Agenda Item 7: Date of Next Meeting

26. The Secretariat would inform Members of the details of the next meeting in due course.

27. The meeting was adjourned at 4:00 p.m.

**Secretariat, ECF Energy Conservation Projects Vetting Sub-committee
December 2013**

Note:

The paragraph will not be included in the version of notes to be uploaded to the webpage of ECFC according to the standing practice of not disclosing the detailed reasons for supporting or rejecting an application. The ECFC webpage contains a general disclaimer that "Reasons for supporting/rejecting an application had been made known to the project proponents concerned, and the public could ask the project proponents direct for such information."